# Table of Contents

About the Author \hspace{2cm} v

Foreword \hspace{2cm} xxv

Preface \hspace{2cm} xxvii

## CHAPTER 1

General Overview of Taxation of Cross-Border Services \hspace{2cm} 1

1. Cross-Border Services \hspace{2cm} 1

2. Taxation of Cross-Border Services under the Domestic Law \hspace{2cm} 1

3. Taxation of Cross-Border Services under the Tax Treaties \hspace{2cm} 2

3.1 Various Articles of the Tax Treaties Dealing with Services \hspace{2cm} 2

3.1.1 Shipping and Air Transport Services (Article 8) \hspace{2cm} 2

3.1.2 Professional Services and Other Independent Activities (Article 14) \hspace{2cm} 3

3.1.3 Income from Employment (Article 15) \hspace{2cm} 3

3.1.4 Director’s Fees (Article 16) \hspace{2cm} 3

3.1.5 Services of Artistes and Sportsmen (Article 17) \hspace{2cm} 3

3.1.6 Pensions (Article 18) \hspace{2cm} 4

3.1.7 Government Services (Article 19) \hspace{2cm} 4

3.1.8 Students (Article 20) \hspace{2cm} 4

3.1.9 General Provisions \hspace{2cm} 5

3.1.9.1 Taxation of Services Income as ‘Business Income’ under Article 7 \hspace{2cm} 5

3.1.9.2 Taxation of Services Income as ‘Other Income’ under Article 21 \hspace{2cm} 5

3.1.10 Specific Article Dealing with Fees for Technical Services \hspace{2cm} 5

3.2 Influence on the Model Conventions \hspace{2cm} 7
CHAPTER 2
FTS Article – Part I

1. Paragraph 1 of Article 12
   1.1 Income ‘Arising’ in a Contracting State
   1.2 Implications of Income ‘Deemed to Arise’ in a Contracting State
   1.3 Implications of Income Not Falling within Paragraph 1 of Article 12
   1.4 ‘Paid to a Resident’
   1.5 ‘May be Taxed’
   1.6 Variations of Paragraph 1 of Article 12
      1.6.1 Derived By
      1.6.2 Technical Fees
      1.6.3 Payment for Use of Equipment
      1.6.4 Fees for Included Services
      1.6.5 Combination of Paragraphs 1 and 2
      1.6.6 ‘Subject to Tax’ Requirement
      1.6.7 Requirement of ‘Beneficial Ownership’ for Taxation in the State of Residence
      1.6.8 Taxation in the Country of Residence
      1.6.9 Payment to an ‘Enterprise’
      1.6.10 Miscellaneous

2. Paragraph 2 of Article 12
   2.1 Scope of Fees Covered under Paragraph 2: ‘Such Fees for Technical Services’
   2.2 Implications of Income ‘Deemed to Arise’ in a Contracting State
   2.3 Taxation ‘in Accordance with the Law of the Source State’
   2.4 Beneficial Ownership
   2.5 Implications Where the Recipient and the Beneficial Owner Are Different Persons
      2.5.1 Implications for the State of Residence
      2.5.2 Implications for the State of Source
   2.6 Maximum Tax in the State of Source
   2.7 Implications of Surcharge under the Domestic Law
   2.8 Variations of Paragraph 2 of Article 12
      2.8.1 Beneficial Ownership
      2.8.2 Cap on Taxation by the State of Source
      2.8.3 ‘Recipient as Beneficial Owner’ versus ‘Beneficial Owner is Resident’
      2.8.4 Reference to Competent Authority
      2.8.5 Limitations of Benefit (LOB)
      2.8.6 Miscellaneous
3. Definition of ‘Fees for Technical Services’ (Paragraphs 3 and 4 of Article 12)  
  3.1 Exclusion for Payments to Employees  
  3.2 Exclusion for Services of Independent Personal Services  
  3.3 Issues Arising from the Definition in Tax Treaties  
  3.4 Variations of Paragraph 3 / 4 of Article 12  
    3.4.1 Managerial, Technical and Consultancy Services  
    3.4.2 Administrative Services, Scientific Services, Management Fees, Technical Fees  
    3.4.3 Management and Professional Fees  
    3.4.4 Provision of Services of Technical or Other Personnel  
    3.4.5 Payment of Any ‘Kind’ versus Payment of Any ‘Amount’  
    3.4.6 Reference to ‘Lump Sum Consideration’  
    3.4.7 Exclusion for Certain Projects / After Sales Services  
    3.4.8 Exclusion for Payments to Employees  
    3.4.9 Exclusion for Services of Independent Personal Services  
    3.4.10 Exclusion for Services Resulting in Service PE or Construction PE  
    3.4.11 Exclusion from ‘Business Profits’  
    3.4.12 Reference to Place of Provision of Services  
    3.4.13 Miscellaneous  
    3.4.14 Other Exclusions  
    3.4.15 Tabular Summary  

4. Paragraph 4 of Article 12 (Permanent Establishment / Fixed Base Situation)  
  4.1 Circular Reference between Paragraph 7 of Article 7 and Paragraph 4 of Article 12  
    4.1.1 Desired Positions  
    4.1.2 Rationale  
    4.1.3 Judicial Precedent  
    4.1.4 Indian Tax Treaties with Tanzania and Zambia  
  4.2 Implication of Exclusion of Paragraph 1 of Article 12  
  4.3 Overlap between Article 14 and Article 12  
  4.4 Rendition of Services for Period Exceeding Prescribed Threshold  
  4.5 Professional Fees Paid by a Person Resident in the Source State  
  4.6 Beneficial Owner versus Resident  
  4.7 Effectively Connected  
  4.8 Fees for Technical Services in Respect of Right or Property  
  4.9 Variations of Paragraph 4 of Article 12  
    4.9.1 Recipient versus Beneficial owner  
    4.9.2 In Respect of Right, Property, Contract or Service  
    4.9.3 Effectively Connected versus Attributable To  
    4.9.4 Reference to ‘Fixed Base’  
    4.9.5 Absence of Exclusion of Paragraph 1 of Article 12
Table of Contents

4.9.6  Paid or Credited 56
4.9.7  Taxation as per the Domestic Law of the Source State as against as per Article 7 56

5.  Paragraph 5 of Article 12 (Deemed Accrual) 57
  5.1  Deemed to Arise: Absence of Linkage with Paragraph 2 57
  5.2  Fees Paid by a Resident of a Contracting State 57
  5.3  Fees Paid in Relation to a Permanent Establishment in a Contracting State 57
  5.4  Fees Paid by a Person Who Is Resident of None of the Contracting States 59
  5.5  Rationale for the Deeming Provision 60
  5.6  Absence of Complete Linkage to Independent Personal Services 60
    5.6.1  Rendition of Professional Services for Period Exceeding the Threshold 61
    5.6.2  Absence of Reference to Fixed Base 61
  5.7  Implications of ‘Where, However’ 62
  5.8  Reference to Contracting State 64
  5.9  Fees Incurred in Connection with the Permanent Establishment 66
  5.10  Borne By 70
    5.10.1  Borne by as ‘Financial Burden’ 71
    5.10.2  Borne by as ‘Deductible’ 71
    5.10.3  Rationale for the ‘Borne By’ Condition 72
    5.10.4  Guidance from OECD Commentary 73
    5.10.5  Judicial Precedents 74
    5.10.6  Comparison with the Domestic Law 79
  5.11  Place of Performance of Services and the Place of Deemed Accrual 79
    5.11.1  Provision of India-Finland Tax Treaty 79
    5.11.2  Provision of Tax Treaties Signed with Iceland, Luxembourg and USA 82
    5.11.3  Meaning of ‘One of the Contracting States’ 84
  5.12  Comparison with the Deeming Provisions of the Indian Domestic Law 90
    5.12.1  Fees Paid by a Resident Not Deemed to Arise in India 90
    5.12.2  Fees Paid by a Non-resident Deemed to Arise in India 94
  5.13  Variations of Paragraph 5 of Article 12 96
    5.13.1  Contracting State, Political Sub-division or a Local Authority as a Payer 96
    5.13.2  Statutory Body, Land or Administrative Territorial Unit as a Payer 97
    5.13.3  Permanent Establishment outside Both the Contracting States 97
    5.13.4  Reference to ‘Fixed Base’ Absent 97
    5.13.5  Place of Performance of Services: Place of Accrual 98
Conclusion of Contract with the Permanent Establishment 98
Contract Effectively Connected with the Permanent Establishment 98
Miscellaneous 99

Paragraph 6 of Article 12 99
Applicability of Arm’s Length Principle 99
Rationale of the Provision 100
Special Relationship 100
Payment Less than Arm’s Length 101
Reclassification of Payment 101
Treatment of Payment Exceeding Arm’s Length Payment 102
Beneficial Owner versus Recipient 102
Variations of Paragraph 6 of Article 12 103
‘Beneficial Owner’ versus ‘Recipient’ 103
‘For Whatever Reasons’ 103
‘Having Regard To...’ 103
Missing Reference to Other Provisions of the Tax Treaties 103
Miscellaneous 103

Chapter 3
FTS Article – Part II 105
Taxability of Fees on Accrual Basis 105
Payment by a Resident of a Contracting State 107
Place of Rendition of Services 108
Requirement of Rendition of Services in a Contracting State as per Definition of FTS 109
Requirement of Rendition of Services in a Contracting State as per the Deeming Accrual Provision 112
Consultancy Services: Technical versus Non-technical 113
Accounting Treatment and Characterization of Income 113
Treatment of Lump Sum Payments 114
Terminology Used by the Parties and Characterization of Income 114
Implications of Characterization Adopted by the Other Contracting State 115
Characterization of Certain Specific Items of Income 116
Credit Rating Services 116
Procurement Charges for Goods 118
Inspection Fees 119
Consideration for Transfer of Documents and Designs 119
ISO Certification 119
Services Linked to Purchase of Machinery 119
Reliance on Other Tax Treaties for the Purpose of Interpretation 120
Article 12 versus Article 7 121
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13. Special Provision versus General Provision</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Taxation of Income from Certain Businesses</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Adoption of Domestic Law Definition in Tax Treaties</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.1 Term Is Not Defined in the Tax Treaty</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.2 Term Is Defined in the Tax Treaty</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3 Argument Based on Section 90</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4 Judicial Precedents</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Adoption of Tax Treaty Definition in the Domestic Law</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1 Argument Based on Section 90</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2 Judicial Precedents</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Applicability of Other Source Article to Fees for Technical Services</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Implications of Absence of Article Dealing with ‘Fees for Technical Services’</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Implications of Two Specific Articles Dealing with ‘Fees for Technical Services’</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 4**

Make Available

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Make Available Provision</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Absence of Term ‘Managerial Services’</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Consideration for Incidental Services</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Ancillary and Subsidiary</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Should the Recipient of ‘Royalties’ and ‘Fees for Technical Services’ Be the Same Person?</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Can a Payment under Separate Agreement Be Said to Be Ancillary?</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Can There Be a Significant Time Gap between the Payment of ‘Royalties’ and ‘Fees for Technical Services’?</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Guidance from Memorandum of Understanding</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Comparable Provision in the Domestic Law?</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Judicial Precedents</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Make Available Condition</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Guidance from the Memorandum of Understanding</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Meaning of the Term ‘Experience’</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Judicial Precedents on ‘Make Available’</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Make Available Condition Not Satisfied</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Make Available Condition Satisfied</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Interpretation Based on Distinction from Article 12(3)(a)</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Consideration for Software</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5 Evidence for Make Available</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.6 Does ‘Support Service’ Necessary Make Available Technical Knowledge?</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.7 Can Technology Be Made Available for Specified Period? 151
4.3.8 Technology to Be Returned: Termination Clause of the Agreements 151

5. Development and Transfer of Technical Plan or Design 152
   5.1 Whether 'Business Strategy' Qualifies as Technical Plan? 153
   5.2 Whether 'Make Available' Condition Necessary to Satisfy? 153
   5.3 Make Available Condition Automatically Met? 153
   5.4 Specific Provision Requiring Application of Technology 154
   5.5 Absolute Transfer Necessary? 154
   5.6 Incidental Satisfaction of the Requirements of the Article 154
   5.7 Adoption / Acceptance of Technology by the Person Availing Services Necessary for Applicability of the Article? 155
   5.8 Make Available: To Whom? 156
   5.9 Transfer of Design: Domestic Law More Beneficial? 156
   5.10 Judicial Precedents 156

6. Stewardship / Shareholders Activities 157

7. Exclusions from the Fees for Included / Technical Services 158
   7.1 Payments Linked to Sale of Property 158
   7.2 Consideration for Services Incidental to International Traffic 159
   7.3 Consideration for Teaching 159
   7.4 Services for Personal Use of the Individuals 161
   7.5 Consideration for Salaries and Professional Fees 162

8. Overlap Provisions 162
   8.1 Overlap between Article 12(3)(a) and Article 12(4)(b) 162
   8.2 Overlap between Article 12(4)(a) and Article 12(4)(b) 162

9. Interpretation of Other Tax Treaties Based on the MOU 162

10. Variation of 'Make Available' Provision 163
    10.1 Services of Technical or Other Personnel 163
    10.2 Application of Technology Contained in Skill, Know-Processes, Etc. 163
    10.3 Application of Technology Contained in Technical Plan or Technical Design 164
    10.4 Managerial Services 164
    10.5 Absence of Exclusions 164
    10.6 Exclusion for 'Private Use' of Services by Individuals 164
    10.7 Exclusion of Services in Connection with Exploration of Natural Resources 164
    10.8 Exclusion for Services Linked to Construction, Installation Project 164
    10.9 Terminology 165
    10.10 Miscellaneous 165
CHAPTER 5
Effectively Connected Fees for Technical Services 173
1. Rationale for Linking the Articles 173
2. Does Article 7 or Article 14 Result in Higher Tax Liability? 174
3. Provisions Dealing with ‘Effectively Connected’ 175
4. Meaning of ‘Effectively Connected With’ 177
5. Examples Based on Guidance from the Commentary 179
5.1 Examples as Regards Dividend Income 180
5.1.1 What Is ‘Forming Part of the Assets’? 180
5.1.2 What Is ‘Otherwise Effectively Connected’? 181
5.2 Examples as Regards Interest Income 182
5.2.1 Debt Claim Forming Part of the Assets 183
5.2.2 Otherwise Effectively Connected 186
6. Examples For Fees For Technical Services / Contract / Services Effectively Connected with the Permanent Establishment / Fixed Base 187
7. Payment by Permanent Establishment: Effective Connected? 191
8. Criteria for ‘Effectively Connected’ 192
9. Guidance from Tax Treaties Signed by Countries 193
10. ‘Effectively Connected With’ versus ‘Attributable To’ 194
10.1 Are These Different Concepts? 194
10.2 Implications of Difference between ‘Effectively Connected With’ and ‘Attributable To’ 196
10.3 Conclusion 197
10.4 Implications of the Words ‘Attributable to’ in the US Model 199
11. Interplay between ‘Force of Attraction Rule’ and ‘Effectively Connected With’ 200
12. Special Feature of UN Model 201
13. Variations of Scope of ‘Effectively Connected’ in the UN Model 202

CHAPTER 6
Article 12 versus Article 14 205
1. Overlap between Article 12 and Article 14 205
2. Provisions for Avoiding Overlap 206
2.1 Variation 1 – Reference to ‘Services’ Mentioned in Article 14 206
2.2 Variation 2 – Reference to ‘Payments’ Mentioned in Article 14 207
2.3 Other Specific Variations for Avoiding Overlap 208
3. Absence of Provisions for Avoiding Overlap 209
4. Scope of Article 14 as a Special Provision 212
4.1 Analysis 214
4.1.1 Reliance on UN Commentary 214
4.2.2 Reliance on the OECD Commentary 215
4.2.3 Heading of the Article 215
4.2.4 Judicial Precedents 216
4.2 Conclusion 218
5. Specific Recognition of the Legal Status of Person Rendering Services 218
  5.1 Specific Reference in Article 12 218
  5.2 Specific Reference in Article 14 218
6. Can Fees for Services Escape Article 12 as Well as 14? 219
7. Implications of Fixed Base 221
  7.1 Fixed Base 221
  7.2 Fixed Base in Paragraph 4 of Article 12 221
    7.2.1 Variation 1 – Specific Exclusion in Paragraph 3 of Article 12 222
    7.2.2 Variation 2 – No Specific Exclusion in Paragraph 3 of Article 12 222
  7.3 Why Is a Reference to Fixed Base in Paragraph 4 of Article 12 Required? 223
    7.3.1 Variation 1 – Specific Exclusion in Paragraph 3 of Article 12 223
    7.3.2 Variation 2 – No Specific Exclusion in Paragraph 3 of Article 12 223
  7.4 Alternative Interpretation 224
    7.4.1 Broad Scheme of the Tax Treaty: Full Taxing Rights to the Source Country 224
    7.4.2 Analysis – Alternative Interpretation 225
  7.5 Applicability of Article 14 to Income Other than Consideration for ‘Independent Personal Services’ 226
Appendix A Article 14 228

CHAPTER 7
Applicability of Other Source Article to the Fees for Technical Services 231
1. Article 21 under the Models and Tax Treaties 232
  2. Provisions of Article 21 233
    2.1 Items of Income 233
    2.2 Class of Income 234
    2.3 Source of Income 234
    2.4 Meaning of ‘Dealt With’, ‘Expressly DEALT With’, ‘Expressly Mentioned’ 235
      2.4.1 DEALT With 235
      2.4.2 Expressly DEALT With 235
      2.4.3 ‘Expressly Mentioned’ 236
  3. What Are the Items of Income Not DEALT With in Other Articles? 236
    3.1 Class of Income Not Specifically DEALT by Any Article 236
    3.2 Where the Definition of Class of Income Is Not Satisfied 236
# Table of Contents

3.3 Where the Income Arises in a Third Contracting State 238  
3.4 Where the Income Arises and Is Paid to a Resident of the Same Contracting State 238

4. Applicability of Article 7 or Article 21 238  
4.1 Scenario 1 – Absence of Specific Article 239  
4.2 Scenario 2 – Non-applicability of Specific Article 240  
4.3 Indications in Paragraph 2 of Article 21 and the OECD Commentary 240  
4.4 Conclusion 241

Appendix A Relevant Extracts of OECD Commentary Using the Word ‘Class’ 243

## Chapter 8
Service PE – Part I 245

1. Definition of Service PE 246  
2. Existence of ‘Service Provider’ and ‘Recipient of Services’ 247  
3. Can a Person Acquiring Services Be Said to Have Service PE? 247  
4. Rationale of Service PE Clause 249  
5. ‘Other Personnel’ 249  
  5.1 Other Personnel: Whether It Includes Non-individuals? 250  
  5.2 Use of the Term ‘Personnel’ in the Domestic Law 250  
  5.3 Dictionary Meaning of the Term ‘Personnel’ 251  
  5.4 Use of the Term ‘Personnel’ in Tax Treaties 251  
  5.5 Use of the Term ‘Personnel’ in the Commentary 251  
  5.6 Conclusion: ‘Personnel’ as an Individual 252  
  5.7 Comparison with the Proposed Service PE Clause in the OECD Commentary 252  
  5.8 Other Personnel: Whether It Includes Employees of a Non-individual Contractor? 253  
  5.9 Should the ‘Personnel’ Not Be Resident of the Host Country? 254  
6. Benefit of Exception Contained in Article 5(7) 256  
  6.1 Effect of Deeming Fiction 256  
  6.2 Rendering Services versus Carrying on Business 257  
  6.3 Can an Independent Agent Render Services on Behalf of an Enterprise? 257  
  6.4 Domestic Law Meaning of the Term ‘Agent’ 258  
  6.5 Conclusion 259  
  6.6 Comparison with the Proposed Service PE Clause in the OECD Commentary 260  
7. Should ‘Other Personnel’ Be Dependent on the Enterprise? 260  
8. Overlap between Service PE and Agency PE? 262  
9. Benefit of Exceptions Contained in Article 5(4) 263
10. **Meaning of ‘Furnishing Services Within’** 264
   10.1 Difference between ‘Services Rendered within a Country’ and ‘Services Rendered in a Country’ 264
   10.2 Presence of Person Availing Services 265
   10.3 Absence of Person Availing Services in the Country: Direct Utilization / Consumption of Services 266
   10.4 Absence of Person Availing Services in the Country – Indirect Utilization of Services 267
   10.5 Utilization of Services in Another Country 269
   10.6 Provision of Services to the Head office 270
   10.7 Furnishing Services versus Rendering Services 272

**Appendix A** Relevant Extracts of the UN Commentary on Article 5(3) 273

**Appendix B** Use of Term ‘Personnel’ in Tax Treaties 277
Table of Contents

7.2 Implications of Non-exclusion 295
7.3 Interplay between Service PE and Article 13(5) 296
7.4 Restricted Article for ‘Technical Fees’ 299
8. Service PE in Terms of the Provisions of the Domestic Law 300
9. Rendition of Services to Associated Enterprises 300
10. Implications of Fulfilment of Service PE Clause 302
11. Proof of Service PE Creation 302
12. Variations of Service PE Clause 302
   12.1 Tax Treaties Signed by India 303
       12.1.1 Placement of Service PE Clause in Article 5 303
       12.1.2 Inclusion versus Deeming Fiction 303
       12.1.3 Number of Months / Days 303
       12.1.4 Reduced Period for Services Rendered to an Associate Enterprise 304
       12.1.5 Nature of Services – Inclusion 305
       12.1.6 Nature of Services – Exclusion 305
       12.1.7 Furnishing Services ‘within a Contracting State’ 306
       12.1.8 Same or a Connected Project 306
   12.2 Tax Treaties Signed by UK 306
       12.2.1 Placement of Service PE Clause in Article 5 306
       12.2.2 Inclusion versus Deeming Fiction 307
       12.2.3 Number of Months / Days 307
       12.2.4 Reduced Period for Services Rendered to an Associate Enterprise 308
       12.2.5 Nature of Services – Inclusion 308
       12.2.6 Nature of Services – Exclusion 309
       12.2.7 Same or a Connected Project 309
       12.2.8 Period or Periods Aggregating 309
       12.2.9 Employees or Other Personnel 309
   12.3 Tax Treaties Signed by USA 310
       12.3.1 Exemption for Activities for a Period Lesser than 30 Days in a Year 310
       12.3.2 One Day PE 310
   12.4 DTAs Signed by Netherlands 310
   12.5 Tax Treaties Signed by France 310
   12.6 Tax Treaties Signed by China 311
       12.6.1 Placement of Service PE Clause in Article 5 311
       12.6.2 Inclusion versus Deeming Fiction 311
       12.6.3 Number of Months / Days 311
       12.6.4 Reduced Period for Services Rendered to an Associate Enterprise 311
       12.6.5 Nature of Services – Inclusion 311
       12.6.6 Nature of Services – Exclusion 312
       12.6.7 Furnishing Services ‘within a Contracting State’ 312
12.6.8  Same or a Connected Project 312
12.6.9  Engaged Personnel 312
12.6.10  Miscellaneous 313

Appendix A  Decisions on Meaning of the Term ‘Month’ 314
Appendix B  Decisions on Applicability of Requirements of Article 5(1) to Service PE 317
Appendix C  Decisions on Rendering Services versus Lending Employees 320

CHAPTER 10
OECD Service PE Provision 325
1.  OECD Approach on Taxation of Services 325
2.  New OECD Approach on Taxation of Services 325
3.  Difficulties in Taxation of Services without Permanent Establishment, i.e. Fixed Place 326
4.  Basic Purpose / Intention of the Service PE Provision 326
5.  Broad Principles for Service PE Provision 326
6.  Suggested Service PE Clause 327
7.  Placement of Service PE Clause 327
   7.1  Placement between Paragraph 3 and Paragraph 4 327
   7.2  Placement between Paragraph 4 and Paragraph 5 328
   7.3  Placement between Paragraph 5 and Paragraph 6 328
   7.4  Placement between Paragraph 6 and Paragraph 7 328
   7.5  Placement under the UN Model 328
8.  Implications of the OECD Commentary on Current and Future Tax Treaties 328
   8.1  Tax Treaties Based on UN Model 328
   8.2  Tax Treaties Based on OECD Model without Service PE Provision 329
9.  Interplay between the Proposed Service PE Provision and Paragraph 1 and Paragraph 2 of Article 5 329
10. Interplay between the Proposed Service PE Provision and Paragraph 3 of Article 5 330
11. Should Not the Special Provision Override General Provision? 330
12. Type of Activity, Place of Performance and Person Availing Benefit 331
13. Person Rendering Services 332
14. One Man Enterprise: Clause (A) of Service PE Provision 332
   14.1  Presence in Other Contracting State 332
   14.2  Should 183 Days Be Continuous? 333
   14.3  How Is Duration of 183 Days to Be Calculated? 333
   14.4  Any 12 Months Period 334
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14.5 Gross Revenue Related Requirements</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.6 Rationale of the Provision</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.7 Income from Active Business Activities versus Passive Activities</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.8 Revenue for the Relevant Period as against Revenue of the Entire Year: Practical Difficulty</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.9 Gross Revenue Presumption in the Case of Self-Employed?</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Clause (B) of the Service PE Provision</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.1 Rendition of Services through One or More Individuals</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.2 Same or Connected Projects</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3 How Is Period of 183 Days Calculated?</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4 Abuse of 183 Days Threshold</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Exclusion for Auxiliary and Ancillary Services</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Deeming Fiction</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Services Provided through Employees of Other Enterprise</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.1 Rationale of the Provision</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.2 Contractual Obligations</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3 Are Both the Entities Treated as Rendering Services?</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.4 Can the Employees of on Enterprise Be Dependent on Another Enterprise?</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Is It Necessary to Examine Applicability of Both Clause (A) and Clause (B)?</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Comparison and Interplay between Clause (A) and Clause (B)</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Interplay between Agency PE and Proposed Service PE Clause</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Interplay between the Proposed Service PE Provision and Paragraph 6 of Article 5</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Comparison with UN Model Provision</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Improvement over UN Model</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 11
Paragraph 2 of Article 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Basic Provision</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Meaning of ‘Therein’</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Scope of ‘Law of the Contracting State’</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Rationale of the Provision</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Meaning of ‘Law’</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Meanings Given under Rules, Circulars, Notifications, Instructions</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Specific Powers to Define the Terms</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Definitions Adopted from Other Laws</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Definitions under the General Law</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 General Meaning Given to Certain Words on the Basis of Other Statutes</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Implications of Court Rulings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Provisions of the Tax Treaties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Implications of Changes in the Domestic Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Static Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Ambulatory Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Amendment to Model Convention and OECD Commentary: Build in Ambulatory Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Paragraph 2 of Article 3 under the Model Conventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Variations of Paragraph 2 of Article 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Term Defined ‘Herein’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Term ‘Not Otherwise Defined’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Reference to Competent Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Implications of Inadequate Definition in Article 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>OECD Commentary 2010 on Paragraph 2 of Article 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>Para 2 of Article 3 in Various Models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 12</strong></td>
<td>United Nation’s Work on Taxation Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Provisions Relevant for Taxation of Services under the UN Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>United Nation’s Work on Taxation Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>Recommendations as per E/C.18/2010/CRP.7 Dated 10 October 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>Note on the Taxation of Fees for Technical and Other Services under the United Nations Model Convention (27 May 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C</td>
<td>Note on Taxation of Services under the United Nations Model Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D</td>
<td>Follow-Up Note on the Taxation of Fees for Technical and Other Services under the United Nations (Draft 28 August 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 13</strong></td>
<td>Taxation under the Indian Domestic Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Taxation under the Indian Domestic Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Main Charging Provisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Accruing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Arising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Reluctance of the Judiciary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

2.4 Reliance on Deeming Provisions 409
2.5 Relevance for Tax Treaties 409

3. Provisions for Certain Specific Types of Services: Presumptive Basis 409

   4.1 Scope of Section 9(1)(vii) 410
   4.2 Source of Income 411
      4.2.1 What Is a Source of Income? 412
      4.2.2 Different Sources for the Same Income 413
   4.3 Place of Rendition of Services 414
      4.3.1 Extra Territorial Provisions: Position in India 414
      4.3.2 Decisions on Extra Territorial Provisions 415
   4.4 Place of Utilization of Services 419
      4.4.1 Manners of Rendition of Services 420
      4.4.2 Place Where the Services Are Immediately Implemented / Rendered as a Place of Utilization of Services (Immediate Location) 420
      4.4.3 Ultimate Beneficiary Location as a Place of Utilization of Services (Ultimate Location) 421
      4.4.4 Analysis: Determination of Place of Utilization Services 422
      4.4.5 Should Services Necessarily Be Utilized in a Particular Country? 422
   4.5 Should Services Necessarily Be Utilized in Respect of Core Functions of the Business? 423
   4.6 When Business Can Be Said To Be Carried on outside India? 424
      4.6.1 Judicial Precedents 425
   4.7 Implication of Time Gap between Rendition of Services and Its Utilization 428
      4.7.1 Services Rendered Prior to Commencement of Business 428
      4.7.2 Used versus Utilized 429
   4.8 Absence of the Words ‘Such Person’ 431
      4.8.1 Intention as Expressed in CBDT Circular 432
      4.8.2 Intention as Expressed in the Memorandum 433
      4.8.3 Judicial Precedent 433
   4.9 Definition of ‘Fees for Technical Services’ 435

5. Taxation on FTS: Gross Basis or Net Basis 436
   6.1 Net Basis of Taxation 436
   6.2 Gross Basis of Taxation 437

7. General 437
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>Relevant Provisions of the Indian Domestic Law</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>Issues Related to Definition of ‘Permanent Establishment’</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>