

# Table of Contents

|              |   |      |
|--------------|---|------|
| Foreword     |   | xvii |
| CHAPTER 1    |   |      |
| Introduction |   | 1    |
| I            | General Introduction                                | 1    |
| II           | Methodology   | 5    |
| III          | Origins of Competition Law                          | 8    |
| IV           | Proliferation of Competition Law                    | 11   |
| V            | Goals and Objectives of Competition Law             | 12   |
| VI           | The Legal Framework of Competition Law              | 16   |
| VII          | Practices Subject to the Control of Competition Law | 17   |
| A            | Multilateral Anticompetitive Agreements             | 18   |
| 1            | Types of Restrictive Agreements                     | 20   |
| a            | Horizontal Agreements                               | 21   |
| i            | Hard-Core Cartels                                   | 21   |
| ii           | Other Horizontal Restrictive Agreements             | 26   |
| b            | Vertical Agreements                                 | 27   |
| B            | Single Firm or Unilateral Anticompetitive Conduct   | 29   |
| 1            | Types of Abusive Practices                          | 34   |
| a            | Exploitative Abuse                                  | 35   |
| i            | Excessive Pricing                                   | 35   |
| b            | Discriminatory Abuse                                | 35   |
| i            | Discriminatory Pricing                              | 35   |
| c            | Exclusionary Abuse                                  | 36   |
| i            | Predatory Pricing                                   | 36   |
| ii           | Exclusive Dealing                                   | 37   |
| iii          | Resale Price Maintenance                            | 37   |
| iv           | Refusal to Deal                                     | 37   |
| v            | Tying or Bundling                                   | 38   |
| vi           | Other Abusive Practices                             | 38   |

## Table of Contents

---

|           |   |   |    |
|-----------|---|---|----|
|           | C | Merger Control  | 39 |
|           | D | Other Practices Controlled by Competition Law                           | 39 |
| VIII      |   | Institutional Design of Competition Law                                 | 40 |
| IX        |   | The Enforcement of Competition Law                                      | 43 |
| X         |   | Types of Competition Law Enforcement                                    | 45 |
|           | A | Public Enforcement of Competition Law                                   | 45 |
|           | B | Private Enforcement of Competition Law                                  | 49 |
|           | C | International Enforcement of Competition Law                            | 52 |
| XI        |   | Interaction of Competition Law Proceedings                              | 54 |
| XII       |   | The Law and Economics of Antitrust Enforcement                          | 57 |
|           | A | The Rationale for Competition Law Enforcement                           | 58 |
|           | B | Modalities of Antitrust Enforcement                                     | 59 |
|           |   | 1 Public Antitrust Enforcement  | 59 |
|           |   | 2 Private Antitrust Enforcement   | 60 |
|           | C | An Economic Approach to Public versus Private Antitrust Enforcement     | 61 |
|           | D | Benefits of Private Antitrust Enforcement                               | 62 |
|           | E | Drawbacks of Private Antitrust Enforcement                              | 65 |
|           | F | Optimality of Public and Private Antitrust Enforcement                  | 68 |
| CHAPTER 2 |   |   |    |
|           |   | Public Enforcement of Competition Law                                   | 73 |
| I         |   | General Introduction  | 73 |
|           | A | Introduction  | 73 |
|           | B | Public Enforcement of Competition Law                                   | 73 |
|           | C | Objectives of the Public Enforcement of Competition Law                 | 74 |
|           | D | Benefits of the Public Enforcement of Competition Law                   | 75 |
| II        |   | Institutions Responsible for the Public Enforcement of Competition Law  | 76 |
|           | A | Legal Basis for the Establishment of the Competition Authority          | 77 |
|           | B | Position of the Competition Authority in the Administrative Structure   | 77 |
|           | C | Composition of the Competition Authority                                | 78 |
|           |   | 1 Appointment of the Chairman of the Competition Authority              | 78 |
|           |   | 2 Number of Members of the Competition Authority                        | 79 |
|           |   | 3 Background of the Members of the Competition Authority                | 80 |
|           |   | 4 Qualifications to Be Appointed as Member of the Competition Authority | 81 |
|           |   | 5 Tenure in Office of the Members of the Competition Authority          | 82 |
|           |   | 6 Removal of the Members of the Competition Authority                   | 84 |
|           | D | Structural Design or Model of the Competition Authority                 | 86 |
|           |   | 1 Models Based on the Number of Agencies Enforcing Competition Law      | 86 |

Table of Contents

|     |      |   |     |
|-----|------|---|-----|
|     | a    | Multiple Institutions   | 86  |
|     | b    | Single Institutions   | 90  |
|     | 2    | Models Based on the Distribution of the Enforcement Functions                   | 92  |
|     | a    | Bifurcated Judicial Model   | 92  |
|     | b    | Bifurcated Agency Model   | 96  |
|     | c    | Integrated Agency Model   | 97  |
|     | E    | Enforcement of Competition Law by Sector Regulators                             | 100 |
| III |      | Procedural Issues   | 105 |
|     | A    | Initiation of the Investigation   | 105 |
|     | 1    | Investigations Initiated by the Competition Authority                           | 105 |
|     | 2    | Investigations Initiated by Complaints or Requests to the Competition Authority | 107 |
|     | B    | Case Selection and Prioritization   | 110 |
|     | C    | Investigation Process   | 113 |
|     | D    | Powers of Investigation   | 114 |
|     | 1    | Power to Request Information  | 115 |
|     | 2    | Power to Take Statements or Testimonies   | 121 |
|     | 3    | Power to Enter and Search Premises  | 124 |
|     | a    | Authorization to Perform an Inspection  | 125 |
|     | i    | Inspections Carried Out with a Judicial Warrant                                 | 125 |
|     | ii   | Inspections Carried Out at the Discretion of the Authority                      | 129 |
|     | iii  | Inspections Carried Out with the Authorization of the Occupants of the Premises | 131 |
|     | b    | Premises Subject to an Inspection   | 131 |
|     | i    | Business Premises   | 131 |
|     | ii   | Residential Premises  | 133 |
|     | iii  | Other Places Subject to an Inspection   | 135 |
|     | c    | Timing of the Inspections   | 136 |
|     | d    | Powers of the Competition Authority in the Course of the Inspection             | 137 |
|     | i    | Power to Enter the Premises   | 138 |
|     | ii   | Power to Search the Premises  | 139 |
|     | iii  | Power to Search Persons   | 139 |
|     | iv   | Power to Request the Production of Documents                                    | 140 |
|     | v    | Power to Examine Documents  | 141 |
|     | vi   | Power to Make Copies of Documents   | 142 |
|     | vii  | Power to Seize Elements   | 143 |
|     | viii | Power to Seal or Mark Elements  | 146 |
|     | ix   | Power to Ask for Explanations and Statements                                    | 148 |

## Table of Contents

---

|    |    |   |     |
|----|----|---|-----|
|    | x  | Power to Use or Cause the Use of Computer Systems   | 149 |
|    | xi | Other Powers of Investigation   | 149 |
| E  |    | Powers of Investigation in Criminal Proceedings   | 150 |
| F  |    | Sanctions in the Course of an Investigation   | 153 |
| IV |    | Leniency Programs   | 155 |
| A  |    | Introduction  | 155 |
| B  |    | Benefits and Negative Effects of Leniency Programs  | 157 |
| C  |    | Rationale for Leniency Programs   | 161 |
| D  |    | Conditions for Effective Leniency Programs  | 163 |
| E  |    | Different Approaches  | 163 |
|    | 1  | Scope of Leniency Programs  | 164 |
|    | 2  | Types of Leniency   | 165 |
|    | a  | Leniency for Undertakings   | 165 |
|    | b  | Leniency for Individuals  | 166 |
|    | 3  | Degree of Leniency  | 167 |
|    | a  | Full Immunity or Exoneration  | 167 |
|    | b  | Reduction of Penalties  | 169 |
|    | 4  | Excluded Leniency Applicants  | 170 |
|    | 5  | Marker System   | 172 |
|    | 6  | Leniency Plus and Penalty Plus Policies   | 172 |
|    | 7  | Financial Rewards to Informants   | 173 |
| F  |    | Protection of Information   | 174 |
| V  |    | Settlements   | 175 |
| A  |    | Introduction  | 175 |
| B  |    | Rationale for Settlement Systems  | 176 |
| C  |    | Benefits of Settlement Systems  | 177 |
| D  |    | Drawbacks of Settlement Systems   | 180 |
| E  |    | Interaction with Leniency Programs  | 181 |
| F  |    | Types of Settlement Systems   | 183 |
|    | 1  | Criminal Enforcement Regimes  | 183 |
|    | 2  | Civil Enforcement Regimes   | 184 |
|    | 3  | Administrative Enforcement Regimes  | 184 |
| VI |    | Sanctions and Remedies  | 184 |
| A  |    | Sanctions for the Infringement of Competition Law   | 186 |
|    | 1  | Authorities Empowered to Impose Sanctions   | 186 |
|    | 2  | Types of Sanctions  | 186 |
|    | a  | Sanctions for the Violation of the Substantial Provisions of Competition Law                  | 187 |
|    | i  | Nature of the Sanctions   | 187 |
|    | ii | Persons Who Can Be Sanctioned for the Breach of the Substantive Provisions of Competition Law | 187 |

Table of Contents

|           |  |  |     |
|-----------|--|--|-----|
|           | iii                                    | Types of Sanctions Imposed for the Breach of the Substantive Provisions of Competition Law | 188 |
|           | b                                      | Sanctions for Procedural Violations  | 199 |
|           | i                                      | Nature of the Sanctions for Procedural Violations  | 199 |
|           | ii                                     | Persons Who Can Be Sanctioned for Procedural Violations                                    | 200 |
|           | iii                                    | Types of Sanctions That Can Be Imposed for Procedural Violations                           | 200 |
|           | c                                      | Sanctions for the Failure to Comply with Decisions by the Authority                        | 201 |
| B         | Remedies                               |  | 203 |
|           | 1                                      | Types of Remedies  | 203 |
|           | a                                      | Interim Measures   | 203 |
|           | b                                      | Permanent Orders   | 209 |
|           | c                                      | Divestiture and Rescission   | 213 |
|           | d                                      | Commitments or Undertakings  | 215 |
|           | e                                      | Restitution to Injured Parties   | 220 |
| VII       | Review and Appeals                     |  | 221 |
|           | A                                      | Introduction   | 221 |
|           | B                                      | Types of Decisions That Can Be Reviewed  | 222 |
|           | C                                      | Persons Who Can Appeal Competition Law Decisions   | 224 |
|           | D                                      | Authorities Responsible for the Review of Competition Law Decisions                        | 225 |
|           | E                                      | Different Types of Review  | 226 |
|           | 1                                      | Administrative Review by the Competition Authority   | 226 |
|           | 2                                      | Administrative Review by Ministries  | 228 |
|           | 3                                      | Judicial Review by Administrative Courts   | 228 |
|           | 4                                      | Judicial Review by Specialized Competition Courts  | 229 |
|           | 5                                      | Judicial Review by Judicial Courts   | 229 |
|           | 6                                      | Judicial Review by the Supreme Court   | 231 |
|           | F                                      | Standard of Review   | 231 |
|           | G                                      | Effects of the Judicial Review   | 233 |
|           | H                                      | Different Types of Decisions   | 234 |
| CHAPTER 3 |  |  |     |
|           | Private Enforcement of Competition Law |  | 235 |
| I         | General Introduction                   |  | 235 |
|           | A                                      | Introduction   | 235 |
|           | B                                      | Definition   | 236 |
|           | C                                      | Modalities of Litigation in Private Antitrust Actions                                      | 237 |
|           | 1                                      | Sword Litigation and Shield Litigation   | 237 |
|           | 2                                      | À Titre Principal and À Titre Incident   | 237 |

## Table of Contents

---

|     |     |  |     |
|-----|-----|--|-----|
|     | 3   | Stand-Alone Actions and Follow-On Actions  | 237 |
|     | D   | Desirability and Benefits of Private Antitrust Enforcement                       | 238 |
|     | E   | Objectives of Private Antitrust Enforcement                                      | 239 |
| II  |     | Private Actions for the Infringement of Competition Law                          | 240 |
|     | A   | Introduction   | 240 |
|     | B   | Statutory Basis for the Private Enforcement of Competition Law                   | 240 |
|     | C   | Legal Forum for Private Antitrust Claims   | 243 |
|     | D   | Standing to Bring a Private Action for the Breach of Competition Law             | 249 |
|     | 1   | Potential Private Plaintiffs   | 251 |
|     | a   | Third-Party Plaintiffs   | 251 |
|     | i   | Direct Purchasers  | 251 |
|     | ii  | Indirect Purchasers  | 252 |
|     | iii | Competitors  | 254 |
|     | iv  | Other Third Party Plaintiffs   | 254 |
|     | b   | Parties to the Anticompetitive Agreement as Potential Plaintiffs                 | 255 |
|     | E   | Collective and Representative Claims   | 255 |
|     | 1   | Types of Collective Redress Mechanisms   | 257 |
|     | a   | Public Interest Litigation   | 258 |
|     | b   | Class Actions  | 258 |
|     | c   | Collective Claims  | 259 |
|     | d   | Representative Actions   | 260 |
|     | e   | Joint Actions  | 260 |
|     | f   | Assignment of Claims   | 261 |
|     | g   | <i>Parens patriae</i> Litigation   | 261 |
|     | F   | Fault Requirement  | 261 |
| III |     | Rules of Evidence  | 263 |
|     | A   | Burden of Proof  | 263 |
|     | 1   | Legal Presumptions   | 264 |
|     | 2   | Prima Facie Evidence   | 264 |
|     | 3   | Reversal of the Burden of Proof  | 265 |
|     | 4   | Burden of Proof Depending on the Type of Challenged Conduct and Legal Provisions | 265 |
|     | B   | Standard of Proof  | 266 |
|     | C   | Admissible Forms of Evidence   | 267 |
|     | D   | Disclosure of Evidence   | 268 |
|     | 1   | Disclosure in Civil Law Countries  | 269 |
|     | 2   | Disclosure in Common Law Countries   | 271 |
|     | E   | Limits of Disclosure   | 272 |
|     | 1   | Professional Secrecy   | 272 |
|     | 2   | Trade Secrets  | 274 |
|     | 3   | Privileged Information in Public Documents                                       | 274 |
|     | F   | Sanctions for the Failure to Disclose  | 275 |

Table of Contents

|    |   |   |     |
|----|---|---|-----|
|    | G | Admissibility of Expert Witnesses                                     | 276 |
|    | 1 | Experts Appointed by Courts   | 277 |
|    | 2 | Experts Hired by the Parties  | 278 |
|    | 3 | Requisites to Be Appointed as an Expert                               | 279 |
|    | 4 | Evidential Value of the Experts' Report                               | 279 |
|    | H | Level of Causation  | 280 |
|    | 1 | Direct and Indirect Causal Link                                       | 280 |
| IV |   | Grounds of Justification  | 281 |
|    | A | The Act of the State That Encourages or Compels the Infringement      | 282 |
|    | B | The Consent of the Plaintiff to the Unlawful Conduct of the Defendant | 282 |
|    | C | The Passing-On Defense  | 283 |
|    | D | Contributory Negligence   | 285 |
| V  |   | Limitation Periods  | 286 |
|    | A | Initiation of the Limitation Periods                                  | 286 |
|    | B | Duration of the Limitation Periods                                    | 288 |
|    | C | Interruption of the Limitation Periods                                | 288 |
| VI |   | Remedies of Private Antitrust Litigation                              | 289 |
|    | A | Nullity of Anticompetitive Agreements                                 | 289 |
|    | 1 | Competent Courts  | 289 |
|    | 2 | Nature, Standing, Effects, and Prescription of Nullity Actions        | 290 |
|    | 3 | Extent of the Nullity Declaration                                     | 290 |
|    | 4 | Right of Restitution  | 292 |
|    | 5 | Severance   | 293 |
|    | 6 | Nullity of Related Contracts  | 293 |
|    | B | Injunctive Relief   | 294 |
|    | 1 | Permanent Injunctive Relief   | 294 |
|    | 2 | Preliminary Injunctive Relief   | 296 |
|    | C | Declaratory Relief  | 296 |
|    | D | Non-monetary Relief   | 297 |
|    | E | Damages   | 298 |
|    | 1 | Justifications for the Award of Damages                               | 298 |
|    | a | Damages as Monetary Compensation                                      | 298 |
|    | b | Damages as the Recovery of Illegal Gains                              | 299 |
|    | c | Damages as Punishment   | 299 |
|    | 2 | Economic Models for the Calculation of Damages                        | 299 |
|    | a | The Before and After Method   | 300 |
|    | b | The Yardstick Method  | 301 |
|    | c | The Cost-Based Method   | 301 |
|    | d | The Price Prediction Method   | 301 |
|    | e | The Theoretical Modeling Simulation Method                            | 302 |
|    | f | The Multiple Regression Analysis Method                               | 302 |

## Table of Contents

---

|      |  |  |     |
|------|--|--|-----|
|      | 3  | Discretion of Courts When Awarding Damages for the Breach of Competition Law | 304 |
|      | 4  | Limitations on the Amount Awarded as Damages                                 | 304 |
|      | 5  | Availability of Punitive, Exemplary, or Multiplied Damages                   | 305 |
|      | a  | Punitive Damages   | 305 |
|      | b  | Exemplary Damages  | 305 |
|      | c  | Multiplied Damages   | 306 |
| F    | Interest   |  | 307 |
|      | 1  | Post-judgment Interests  | 307 |
|      | 2  | Pre-judgment Interests   | 307 |
| VII  | Litigation Expenses  |  | 308 |
| A    | Litigation Costs   |  | 308 |
|      | 1  | Court Costs  | 309 |
|      | 2  | Party Costs  | 310 |
| B    | Recoverability of Legal Expenses   |  | 310 |
| C    | Funding Litigation   |  | 311 |
|      | 1  | Legal Aid  | 312 |
|      | 2  | Contingency Fees   | 312 |
|      | 3  | Conditional Fee Arrangements   | 313 |
|      | 4  | Professional Funders   | 314 |
|      | 5  | Legal Aid Insurance or After the Event Insurance                             | 314 |
| VIII | Interaction between Private and Public Proceedings                                 |  | 315 |
| A    | Introduction   |  | 315 |
| B    | Interaction between the Competition Authority Proceedings and Court Proceedings    |  | 315 |
|      | 1  | The Requirement of a Prior Decision by the Competition Authority             | 315 |
|      | 2  | Concurrency of Public and Private Proceedings                                | 316 |
| C    | Rules of Evidence regarding the Interaction between Public and Private Proceedings |  | 317 |
|      | 1  | Access to Documents Held by the Competition Authority and Courts             | 317 |
|      | 2  | Evidential Value of Decisions Issued by the Competition Authority and Courts | 320 |
|      | a  | Decisions by the Competition Authority as Evidence in Civil Proceedings      | 321 |
|      | b  | Decisions by the Competition Authority Binding on Civil Proceedings          | 321 |
|      | c  | Non-binding Opinions by Competition Authorities                              | 323 |
| D    | Interaction between Leniency Programs and Private Actions for Damages              |  | 325 |
| IX   | Arbitration of Competition Law Disputes  |  | 329 |
| A    | Introduction   |  | 329 |



Table of Contents

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
| B         | Interplay and Tension between Arbitration and Competition Law             | 331 |
| C         | Arbitrability of Competition Law Disputes                                 | 332 |
| D         | Arbitrator's Duty to Apply Competition Law                                | 334 |
| E         | Powers of the Arbitrators   | 337 |
|           | 1 Interim Measures  | 338 |
|           | 2 Powers to Request Information   | 339 |
|           | 3 Use of Experts in Arbitration   | 340 |
| F         | Arbitration and Competition Authorities                                   | 340 |
|           | 1 Cooperation of the Competition Authority in Arbitration                 | 341 |
|           | 2 Stays   | 342 |
|           | 3 Effects of the Competition Authority's Decision in Arbitration          | 344 |
|           | 4 Competition Authority's Use of Arbitration in Merger Remedies           | 345 |
| G         | Review of Arbitration Awards  | 347 |
| CHAPTER 4 |   |     |
|           | Self-Enforcement and Antitrust Compliance                                 | 351 |
| I         | General Introduction  | 352 |
| II        | Self-Enforcement and Antitrust Compliance                                 | 354 |
|           | A Legal Obligation to Comply with the Law                                 | 355 |
|           | B Perception of Internal and External Factors to Comply with the Law      | 355 |
|           | C Corporate Social Responsibility   | 356 |
| III       | Antitrust Compliance Programs   | 357 |
| IV        | Drivers of Compliance and Non-compliance                                  | 360 |
|           | A Drivers That Encourage Compliance                                       | 360 |
|           | 1 Fear of Monetary Sanctions Imposed on Corporations and Individuals      | 360 |
|           | 2 Fear of Imprisonment  | 361 |
|           | 3 Fear of Damage to Individual or Corporate Reputation                    | 362 |
|           | 4 Morality  | 362 |
|           | 5 Effective Compliance Training Programs                                  | 363 |
|           | 6 Disciplinary Measures and Positive Incentives                           | 363 |
|           | 7 Impact of Competition Investigations and Litigation Cause on Compliance | 364 |
|           | 8 A Genuine and Credible Culture of Compliance                            | 364 |
|           | 9 Influence of Compliance Programs on the Sanctions                       | 364 |
|           | B Drivers That Encourage Non-compliance                                   | 365 |
|           | 1 A Corporate Culture of Non-compliance                                   | 365 |
|           | 2 Lack of or Ambiguity in Senior Management's Commitment to Compliance    | 365 |

## Table of Contents

---

|           |   |   |     |
|-----------|---|---|-----|
|           | 3 | Market Conditions That Facilitate the Infringement of Competition Law | 367 |
|           | 4 | Ignorance of the Legal Consequences of Non-compliance                 | 367 |
|           | 5 | The Rogue Employee as a Driver of Non-compliance                      | 368 |
|           | 6 | Influence of the Compliance Programs on the Sanctions                 | 368 |
| V         |   | Essential Features of Effective Compliance Programs                   | 369 |
|           | A | Risk Assessment   | 369 |
|           | B | Integrated Approach   | 370 |
|           | C | Standards   | 370 |
|           | D | Controls  | 370 |
|           | E | Empowered Compliance Officer  | 370 |
|           | F | Resources and Infrastructure  | 370 |
|           | G | Board Oversight   | 371 |
|           | H | Senior Management Support   | 371 |
|           | I | Personnel Practices   | 371 |
|           | J | Training and Communication  | 372 |
|           | K | Third Parties   | 372 |
|           | L | Audit and Monitor   | 372 |
|           | M | Measure Effectiveness   | 372 |
|           | N | Reporting System  | 373 |
|           | O | Protection from Retaliation   | 373 |
|           | P | Discipline  | 373 |
|           | Q | Incentives  | 373 |
|           | R | Response to Violations  | 374 |
|           | S | Diligence and Industry Practice                                       | 374 |
|           | T | Documentation   | 374 |
| VI        |   | Guidance and Best Practices for Antitrust Compliance Programs         | 374 |
| VII       |   | Compliance Programs and Competition Law Enforcement                   | 378 |
| VIII      |   | Different Approaches by Competition Law Enforcers                     | 381 |
|           | A | Compliance Programs as a Mitigating Factor                            | 381 |
|           | B | Compliance Programs as an Aggravating Factor                          | 383 |
|           | C | Compliance Programs and Settlement Agreements and Leniency Programs   | 385 |
| CHAPTER 5 |   |   |     |
|           |   | Conclusions   | 389 |
| I         |   | General Conclusions   | 389 |
| II        |   | Conclusions to the Public Enforcement Chapter                         | 398 |
|           | A | Inadequate Competition Law Commands                                   | 398 |
|           | B | Weak Competition Law Institutions                                     | 400 |
|           | C | Ineffective Sanctioning Systems                                       | 403 |
|           | D | Deficient Judicial Review Mechanisms                                  | 410 |

## Table of Contents

---

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| III | Conclusions to the Private Enforcement Chapter                           | 411 |
| A   | Unclear Legal Basis for the Private Enforcement of Competition Law       | 413 |
| B   | Inexperienced Competent Courts to Handle Competition Law Cases           | 414 |
| C   | Limited Legal Standing   | 414 |
| D   | Unavailability of Effective Collective Redress Mechanisms                | 415 |
| E   | Impossibility to Access Relevant Information and High Standards of Proof | 416 |
| F   | Excessive Cost of Private Litigation                                     | 417 |
| G   | Rough Interaction between Private and Public Proceedings                 | 418 |
|     | Bibliography   | 421 |
|     | Table of Cases   | 443 |
|     | Table of Legislation   | 453 |
|     | Table of Competition Authorities   | 465 |
|     | Index  | 475 |

